



GRAND TRAVERSE RURAL FIRE BOARD MEETING

Paradise Township Hall
2300 E. M-113
Kingsley, MI 49649

May 18, 2016

Regular Meeting held at 6:00 p.m.

Chairman Tim Trudell Vice-Chair Linda Forwerck Treasurer Doug Moyer

Members: Fife Lake -Linda Forwerck, Grant - Doug Moyer, Green Lake- Marv Radtke, (Alternate), Paradise- Tim Trudell, Springfield- Tom Gonyer, Union- Doug Mansfield, Whitewater- Ron Popp

Any interested person or group may address the Grand Traverse Rural Fire Board on any agenda item when recognized by the presiding Chairman or upon request of any Board Member. Also, any interested person or group may address the Grand Traverse Fire Board on any matter of Fire Department concern not on the Agenda during the agenda item designated Public Comment. The comment of any member of the public or any special interest group may be limited in time. Such limitation shall not be less than five minutes unless otherwise explained by the presiding Chairman, subject to appeal by the Grand Traverse Rural Fire Board.

I. Roll Call

Grant (present), Green Lake (present), Paradise (present), Springfield (present), Union (present), Whitewater (present) and Fife Lake (present).

II. Approval of Agenda

The Chairman asked for a motion to add an item to the agenda under New Business, Item A. Green Lake Township. **Union moved to approve the agenda with the inclusion of New Business, Item A. Green Lake Township, Fife Lake seconded All in favor, motion carried.**

III. Conflict of Interest

The Chairman inquired from Green Lake Township if it was felt a conflict existed regarding the Letter of Intent to withdraw from Grand Traverse Rural Fire. Green Lake responded they did not feel a conflict existed as they were there as a governmental representative.

IV. Consent Calendar

The purpose of the consent calendar is to expedite business by grouping non-controversial items together to be dealt with by one Board motion without discussion. Any member of the Board, staff or the public may ask that any item on the consent calendar be removed therefrom and placed elsewhere on the agenda for individual consideration by the Board; and such requests will be automatically respected. If an item is not removed from the consent calendar, the action noted in parentheses on the agenda is approved by a single Board action adopting the consent calendar.

- a. Minutes - The Board approves the minutes of Grand Traverse Rural Fire Board April 20, 2016 meeting minutes.
- b. Payroll – The Board approves April 7, 2016 Payroll #6 in the amount of \$10,432.93 and Payroll #7 in the amount of \$4,968.87 for April 21, 2016.
- c. Accounts Payable – The Board approves Pre-authorized claims for May 4, 2016 in the amount of \$2,379.25, Vendor’s payable May 18, 2016 in the amount of \$22,964.98.
- d. Reports and Communications –The Board directs the staff to receive, file and respond to communications as necessary. (Financial, Chief’s, RTC, Attorney)

Union moved to approve the Consent Calendar as presented, Fife Lake seconded. 6 ayes, 1 nay (Whitewater), motion carried.

V. Public Comment

Andy Marek, 2875 Railroad Avenue, Interlochen – Mr. Marek identified himself as a candidate for the Supervisor position with Green Lake Township. He also shared various attributes which he feels will qualify himself for the position. Mr. Marek has had concerns with on-going issues with the Fire Department and the supervisor. With a new board coming on in the fall he feels the withdrawal may be premature as everything could change with new board members.

VI. Unfinished Business

- a. Station Leases (postponed)
- b. ISO (Update)
Chief Weber has yet to secure an RFP from a consultant. He did attend the Blair Township ISO audit and was able to develop a relationship with the auditor. Format has changed as they are now requiring fresher data for their customer, a very competitive insurance industry. Our audit is scheduled for April 2017 which will be a full audit. After this date the new process is to only review changes within the department/region.
- c. Organizational Consultant RFP
The Chairman opened discussion by saying the Chief went over and above seeking out qualified individuals to perform the organization review. The two companies Center for Public Safety Management (CPSM) and Emergency

Services Consulting International (ESCI) both traveled here to explain the process, at our expense. It recently came to the Board's attention that Green Lake has hired CPSM to provide a station operational review. The Chairman feels this undermined our process and Green Lake should have found and hired their own consultant. He added that he found Green Lakes' actions offensive and frustrating. This was also done with no communication from Green Lake to the Fire Board that they had interviewed or were considering CPSM.

The Chairman asked Chief Weber which consultant he felt would be the best fit for the process. Chief Weber responded both were competent and adequate but he initially felt CPSM was the better fit. However now he is not certain the process can be completed without conflicting interests. Chief Weber added that ESCI is an excellent consultant and could probably do the same job. He added that it will take approximately 30 days of staff time, at his expense to provide Green Lake with the necessary data, our data, to complete their study.

The Chairman asked each of the members of the Board their thoughts on the consultants and proposals. Grant stated in lieu of the position with Green Lake he felt the cost was significantly higher than originally thought. Whitewater wondered if we could "cherry-pick" elements. Fife Lake also thought the price was than thought and added what if Green Lake leaves and Grant goes along. Where do we go if Green Lake is serious? Where will Rural go? Paradise stated they are not going anywhere, they couldn't afford it. Paradise feels CPSM would have been a good selection, and agrees with Whitewater that the ability to cherry-pick would be good. He added both consultants felt we had a great Chief and firefighters combined with good funding and structure. Where are we lacking to do great things? Union felt a legal review provided by Mr. Young had both positive and negative elements for utilizing the same firm. The Chairman responded they should be off the table as Green Lake has not been honest and in or out we may not get an honest answer. Union answered that he is optimistic. Both Green Lake and Rural have looked into hiring a consultant, this is positive for constituents of both Green Lake and Rural. He does not believe consultants would sell their reputation for \$50,000. Union also wishes Green Lake would have communicated their intent as shared studies are often done in the region. Could we work together to solve things? He sees an issue, not a problem. Union stated that CPSM is the better choice. Green Lake is not in or out of Rural, the letter as written only states their intent. At this time they do not have enough information to move forward to make a decision. Their process was announced through a December 2015 resolution, followed by the RFP process in February and hiring CPSM on May 9, 2016. He has been vocal about staying with Rural but after three years of discussion no headway has yet been made on a strategic plan. The Green Lake Board must pursue the best interest of their residents. Green Lake would select CPSM for the Rural Fire review. Springfield feels there is an advantage to using the same consultant in this on-going situation. At some point we must move forward. There is no sense in putting it off and right now the money is there.

Fife Lake inquired from Union if there may be a cost savings to sharing the consultant. Union stated there could be, logistically it might be difficult – scheduling. He added negotiation is always possible. Green Lake added that currently their runs are 75% EMS and that is primarily what the RFP went out for. Chief Weber shared that Mr. Young is in Washington D.C. and could meet with the consultant to determine if the process could be completed without conflict.

Whitewater inquired from Grant why he felt people were leaving due to the cost involved. Grant responded the community feels townships will have to kick in more money with the increased cost of equipment and other expenses. Union added that information from the process will be needed if we need to approach our communities for an increase in assessments. Townships need to have the reasons why so much money is needed. Long Lake didn't leave because of the money, but rather philosophy and politics. Grant respectfully disagreed.

The Chairman asked the members if they were at a point to select a consultant. The pricing can be negotiated. After a round table discussion CPSM was the clear choice. Union stated the Chief could negotiate with CPSM pricing and scope as he has the most experience with phrasing and tasks which need to be done. The Chairman would like to recommend Mr. Young meet with CPSM and provide an open and honest opinion to both Rural and Green Lake.

Whitewater added that as members we need to agree amongst ourselves to implement. He feels the Fire Board is ready, but the information must be their Boards to be dealt with. Union agreed. We need to have hard questions asked about service to our constituents. Commissioners and Fire Staff need to be on the same page. The Chief stated the Forensics Analysis of our department will tell us the public's expectation. Response times vary with a volunteer staff.

The members discussed expectations for a discounted service since the company will also be working with Green Lake. After full discussion and input **Paradise moved to authorize Chief Weber to accept full proposal from Center for Public Safety Management, LLC (CPSM) and to discuss reduction in fee accepting not less than 5% but to begin at 15%, Fife Lake seconded. After further discussion, roll call vote Fife Lake (yes), Grant (no), Green Lake (yes), Paradise (yes), Springfield (yes), Union (yes), Whitewater (yes). Motion carried.**

VII. New Business

- a. Green Lake Letter of Intent to withdraw from Rural Fire. Motion by Fife Lake to accept the Green Lake Township Letter of Intent to withdraw from Rural Fire, Union supported. **6 ayes, 1 nay (Whitewater), motion carried.**

VIII. Second Public Comment

David Bieganowski, 5658 Karlin, Interlochen, Green Lake township. He has been a municipal attorney for 20 years, and is insulted with accusation they stole the consultant. In the future call or talk to me to get the facts. Their process began in December 2015 and ran parallel with Rural Fire. They selected their firm on May 9 and he is amazed this board picked one tonight. Seven consultants were selected and 4 responded with RFPs. He was not aware consultants had been paid by Rural to be here and both came to Green Lake.

Lieutenant Ken Fritz, 9809 Dell Road, Kingsley. Congratulations on decision. It is his opinion as well that things are at a stalemate on the board and things are not getting done. The bigger department the stronger we are. Losing townships means losing personnel. These are all volunteers with working jobs. I agree with Mr. Popp, the hard work comes after by following through on the recommendations, we must act on them. What makes a department stronger and makes it last? EMS model?

IX. Adjournment

**Fife Lake moved to adjourn at 7:37 pm. Green Lake supported. All in favor.
Motion carried.**



Timothy Trudell, Chairman



MaryJo Barck, Recording Secretary